

# 从艺术品到石窟寺古迹

—— 1913—1914年龙门石窟事件对文物保护工作的意义

## From Work of Art to Grotto Sites

—— The Impact of the 1913—1914 Longmen Grottoes Incident to China's Cultural Heritage Conservation

周孟圆<sup>1,2\*</sup>

ZHOU Mengyuan<sup>1,2\*</sup>

(1.复旦大学文物与博物馆学系,上海 200433;2.苏州大学艺术学院,江苏 苏州 215000)

(1.Department of Cultural Heritage and Museology, Fudan University, Shanghai 200433, China;

2. School of Art of Soochow University, Suzhou Jiangsu 215000, China)

**摘要:**20世纪初的西方来华考古探险潮,让中国石窟寺遗迹成了“重新被发现的”珍宝之窟。石窟寺中丰富的古代佛教造像,满足了西方人长久找寻的中国古代“造型艺术”的愿望。然而,中国佛教造像在国际世界的名声大噪,却引发了大规模的石窟寺盗凿和佛头贩卖。1913年,巴黎赛努奇博物馆的亚洲佛教艺术展览引起西方收藏界对中国古代雕塑的追捧,成为中国美术史书写的转折点。文章聚焦1913—1914年的龙门石窟事件,揭示外部世界对中国石窟寺所投射的目光,一方面加剧了“作为艺术品的佛头”的暴力掠夺与国际收藏;另一方面又激发了中国政府开启“作为整体文化遗产”的石窟寺保护事业。作为后发国家,发生在中国石窟寺空间中的暴力与掠夺,让佛像和人在旧世界中所建立的宗教圣像关系慢慢出现缝隙,新的审美关系与现代文物意识开始逐步建立。

**关键词:**石窟寺破坏与保护;马克密;龙门石窟;佛教造像;文物保护观念

**中图分类号:**K87 **文献标志码:**A

**DOI:**10.19490/j.cnki.issn2096-698X.2021.06.035-044

**Abstract:** Western archaeological expeditions in China at the beginning of the 20th century have shed light on the Chinese Buddhist cave temples as “long-lost treasure”. The rich array of ancient rock carved Buddhist statues satisfied the pursuing of Chinese plastic art that sinologists and western collectors have long sought. The rising reputation of Chinese Buddhist statues, however, has triggered a large-scale Buddha head trafficking and destruction of cave temples. In 1913, the great success of the Asian Buddhist Art Exhibition at the Cernuschi Museum in Paris inspired great interests in western collectors in Chinese ancient sculptures,

**作者简介(\*通信作者):**周孟圆(1988—),女,讲师,博士研究生,主要研究方向为文化遗产价值、文物修复理论、艺术史与物质性。

E-mail:myzhou@suda.edu.cn.

**基金项目:**苏州大学艺术学院青年教师研究基金项目(YSQJ2020002)资助

and became a turning point in the writing of Chinese art history. This essay examines the 1913—1914 Longmen Grottoes Incident, revealing how western gaze has changed, shaped and destroyed art object. The “rock-carved Buddhist statue as work of art”, on one hand, boosted the international art market and museum collections; on the other, the plunder and violence that took place in Longmen taught a lesson to the Chinese government to reconsider preserving cave temples as monument. Religious icons were transformed gradually into art object, and laws and regulations were formulated to preserve monuments such as the cave temples.

**Keywords:** preservation and destruction of grottoes; Fredrick McCormick; Longmen Grottoes; Buddhist statue; cultural heritage conservation ideals

## 1 1913年以前的石窟破坏与海外艺术市场

阿部贤次(Stanley K. Abe)近年发表的系列研究显示,在1905年之前,中国的古代佛教造像还养在深闺,并不为海外的东亚艺术研究和收藏领域所熟知。1905年,在英文世界影响力最大的艺术期刊上,英国艺术史家霍尔姆斯(C.J. Holmes)如此写道:“根据我们目前对中国(雕塑)的认知,我们只能猜测这个国家从来没有出现过高雅的雕塑风格流派。因此,中国青铜器代表了这个国家造型艺术最完美的形式”。

这样的判断,首先是因为大多数中国石窟寺都坐落在内陆腹地的偏远地区。石窟寺的兴盛与早期佛教传播和山林禅修有关,8世纪后伴随佛教的世俗化,北方石窟寺庙也逐渐荒芜,渐渐不为中国精英阶层所关注,也不再大量被书写讨论。其次,作为中国邻国的日本和韩国,虽普遍接受本国佛教造像是由古代中国传入的,但都纷纷推测唐以及唐以前的中国佛像早已绝迹。这个时期的欧美艺术史研究学者,为了填补中国在古代造型艺术(plastic art)方面的“空

白”,往往跟随中国本土的金石学家,将研究目光转向中国的青铜器研究<sup>①</sup>。由于对中国古代佛教造像所知甚少,所以早期的海外研究者往往深受中国金石家影响,大量关注并收藏商周青铜器,以此在书写中代替雕塑(sculpture),构建起“中国古代的造型艺术”这一知识话语对象<sup>②</sup>。这也是早期中国美术史书写的一大特色。

这种情况显然随着深入腹地的外国来华探险潮到来而发生了改变。从19世纪下半叶起,中亚探险开始成为一种世界性的热潮。到了20世纪的头20年,这股探险潮到达了一个巅峰。地球上几个未经探索的区域(如北极、南极等),在19世纪一一被世界各国著名的探险家征服,然而亚洲的腹地,如塔里木盆地、青藏高原、克孜勒库姆沙漠等地区,还处在未经探查的状态。其中,尤其以联结亚欧大陆沿线的“丝绸之路”为各国探险家所追逐的热点。随着清季国门的打开,地质学家、考古学家、探险家以及逐利的商人一同涌入中国。这些团体中,对中国古代佛像兴趣最大的,是像大谷光瑞、橘瑞超等组成的日本僧侣探险团,

① 最早用外语写就的中国艺术出版物之一,是帕莱奥洛格(Maurice Paléologue)在1887年写的L'art chinois。这本书呈现的中国艺术品精品都是青铜器,其中的雕塑(sculpture)章节,展示了赛努奇在中国市场买的陶瓷、青铜材质的晚清民国新造佛教、道教神像。此后,布舍尔(Stephen Bushell)于1904—1906年在伦敦出版了2卷本的Chinese Art。布舍尔曾前往中国,他受到了中国金石家的趣味影响,将石鼓、碑刻、拓片等纳入雕塑(sculpture)分类下。

以及冈仓觉三、早崎幸吉这样的日本艺术商贩。他们大多是接受了西方人文艺术现代教育的日本人,对东亚佛教有着很深造诣。与西方探险家在新疆地区的专注考古活动不同,他们更加有意识地深入甘肃、山西、河北、山东等地,在中国腹地探寻古代佛教遗迹,尤其密切关注唐朝以前的佛教造像。这些人群在推动中国佛教遗迹成为现代目光中的“佛教美术”过程中,扮演了绝对重要的中间人角色。

1902年,冈仓觉三和早崎幸吉到中国采买艺术品。2人在前一次的旅行中已经到过龙门石窟,他们通过比较日本的佛像和龙门造像的风格,确定了中国还大规模存在比日本更早的唐代佛像。或许因为龙门石窟过于受瞩目,此行他们选择了西安宝庆寺作为采买目标。宝庆寺寺内有一座清代重修寺塔,塔上镶嵌的石质雕刻旧件年代古老、造型古朴,冈仓觉三通过风格判断是珍贵的唐时旧作,于是经过劝说,从僧人手中买下了这批25件石刻佛像,并于1906年成功运往日本。这成了第一批大规模离开中国流向国际市场的重要古代石刻佛像。这批作品中的21件留在了日本,4件流入美国境内,其中2件经由冈仓觉三的亲自操办,1906年由美国波士顿美术馆购入<sup>[217-16]</sup>(图1、图2)。

1908年,伯希和与斯坦因相继带着莫高窟所获满载而归欧洲。1909年沙畹在巴黎出版《华北考古图谱》,在这本记录了大量石质雕刻实物照片的出版物中,展现了龙门石窟和云冈石窟的实地拍摄,也使中国石窟寺在西方社会正式引起关注。如果说早期的欧洲来华探险,最初还是以考古地理等学科为主导,引起的是西方知识界的兴趣,推动了海外汉学的学术研究发展,那么自1910年起,随着中亚考古成果的出版、展示和传播,以及古老精美的中国石质佛教造像实物的外流与展览,佛教造像进一步巩固成了被大众观赏的审美对象,石像的雕工、线条、造型、趣味等都成了激发观众审美体验的源泉,欧美博物馆开始纷纷补充扩张亚洲雕塑藏品,私人买家和博物馆也在东亚佛教艺术市场展开了竞争。

在佛教造像“成为中国雕塑”的路上,造像之美受到了国际美誉和价值肯定。魏晋唐宋的佛像造型端庄,有着独有的东方美学意味,被认为是与古希腊罗马雕塑一样的雕塑杰作,但这只构成了硬币的一面,硬币的另一面,是海外市场 and 利益诱惑下越来越猖獗的盗



图1 西安宝庆寺华塔旧照(来源:或为早崎幸吉所摄, 1896年发表于日本艺术刊物Kokka)



注:此浮雕来自宝庆寺华塔,冈仓觉三1906年为美术馆购入,藏品号06.1905。

图2 波士顿美术馆藏观音立像浮雕  
(来源:<https://collections.mfa.org/objects/24276>)

卖活动。为了使海外藏家占有获得这些“艺术珍品”，完整的艺术品交易链条从北京、上海直通纽约、巴黎，不可移动的石窟造像不断被迫成为可移动的商品。

盗取者为了便利地带走一尊无法移动的造像，往往会采取暴力的湮神行为：将原本具有神圣意义的宗教偶像打破成碎块，夺取其中审美价值最高的佛头、佛手和菩萨像，然后通过贸易网络和远洋运输，将这些局部的碎片不远千里带到一个陌生环境中，通过灯光、展柜和去语境化的展示，重新塑造成一个观看欣赏的对象。然而留在原地的石窟洞穴寺庙，剩下的只有半具石像残身和永恒的空洞。

## 2 1913年巴黎大展掀起的中国雕塑热潮

可以确定的是，著名古董商卢芹斋在1909年之前，都没有介入中国佛教造像的买卖。但是，当赛努奇博物馆(Cernuschi Museum)馆长德·提扎克(d'Ardenne de Tizac)给他看了一张隋代的佛头照片后，他似乎被这尊佛像的纯净之美打动了，立刻决定“在中国艺术中拓展一条全新的商品线”<sup>[3]</sup>。于是，1909年卢芹斋在北京的办事处通过庞大的国内古玩交易网络，从北齐响堂山石窟凿取了大批量佛头、佛像、菩萨像和塔柱浮雕，作为采买的石刻艺术品。这批造像在中国没有找到任何感兴趣的买家，因而被运到了巴黎。但是在巴黎，也没有藏家有兴趣购买。于是卢芹斋将这批造像的照片不断流转推销向全欧洲的大买家们，依旧难以脱手。根据卢芹斋的自述可知，在1909年之前，中国佛像在欧美私人收藏圈中还没有形成大规模的市场。

然而在1913年的巴黎大展之后，情况就变了。1913年，法国巴黎的赛努奇博物馆举办了一场前所未有的亚洲佛教艺术大展，这次展览不仅是巴黎轰动一时的文化热事，而且成了推动佛教造像成为中国造型艺术代表的里程碑事件。展览一共陈列了600余件来自印度、柬埔寨、老挝、韩国、日本和中国的雕刻与绘画。其中陈列的中国佛教石质雕刻，尤其受到大量观众的称赞。当展览结束后，许多展品就成了藏家之间相互竞争的炙手可热的商品。这场展览之所以让无人问津的中国佛像一跃成为炙手可热的收藏焦点，可能是因为构建了一个泛亚洲多地区佛教艺术展

品环境，因此在视觉脉络上，中国佛教造像对周边国家的风格影响尤为彰显。

在塞努奇大展上，石刻佛像与大量的中国传统绘画、碑帖并置在一起，造像的审美特征得到了最佳观赏效果。阿部贤次在经过长期专题梳理研究后得出结论，认为“正是这次巴黎大展，推动了中国佛教造像从宗教偶像变成了高雅的雕塑艺术品”<sup>[4]</sup>。此后，各大博物馆、美术馆和私人藏家纷纷将收藏目光转向了中国佛教艺术，这股热潮也迅速席卷了美国波士顿、纽约以及英国伦敦。此次展览上的很多展品，在1913年之后，先后进入了波士顿美术馆、宾夕法尼亚博物馆和大都会博物馆，成了馆藏亚洲雕塑精品。

随着赛努奇的佛像展品逐一在各个藏家手中相互流通，1915年，卢芹斋手中滞留多时的响堂山石窟造像也终于找到了买家，其中一部分被卖给了纽约的藏家梅耶夫妇(Eugene Meyer & Agnes Meyer)，另一部分进入费城大学博物馆(今宾夕法尼亚大学博物馆)成为馆藏。

## 3 1913—1914年龙门石窟事件

同样在1913年，10月7日《字林西报》(The North-China Daily News)刊登了美国通讯记者马克密(Fredrick McCormick)的一篇英文专题信稿，标题为《中国古迹：受难的龙门石窟》，副标题是“破坏不断，急需保护”(图3)。在这篇新闻里，马克密报道了一个重要信息，他从报纸上注意到一篇来自巴黎的最新新闻，称一位著名巴黎时装设计师购买了一尊从中国河南流出的真人大小的古代佛像。而自赛努奇博物馆的亚洲艺术大展后，巴黎流行起了收藏中国佛头的风潮，许多藏家从古董商手中获取的佛头背后，都有从岩体上新近凿刻下来的痕迹。

显然，马克密怀疑这些贩卖到巴黎的石质佛像是从龙门石窟上凿下来的。同一时期到访龙门石窟的罗振玉，也在日记中写道：“近泰西人游此者甚多，得出资令工凿之。使官吏不为保护，则寺僧窃卖，旅客凿取，此名迹将日渐颓废，是可为太息者也。伊阙造像之被盗，首自琉璃厂肆估祝续斋，始壬子(1912年)癸丑(1913年)以后，效尤者日众。地方贪蠹且阴庇之，而坐分其利，于是益无忌惮，遂残毁至此”<sup>[5]</sup>。

可認物便郵種三第

NOTES & COMMENTS.

TERROURISM?

We wish neither to exaggerate nor to minimize the importance of the situation revealed in the article headed "Rebel Refugees" which we print to-day. Either alternative may be thought to present equal dangers. That the numbers of the Chapel community who appealed to the Municipal Council last July to intervene on their behalf have been subjected to unpleasantness from those against whom such intervention was sought, cannot be doubted. It is quite within bounds of probability that they have been seriously threatened. On the other hand, the present is a time when scores are all too readily credited, with proportionately harmful results. We note the facts, therefore, as far as they can be obtained, with this certainty that the suspicions recorded are not wholly groundless, as evidenced by the latest discovery of the police. But whether it be a case of local terrorism or of wider political conspiracy, one thing is perfectly clear. Both alike derive from the same sense of immunity and will yield to the same treatment. When the Consul Body decide, or is authorized, to show the plotters plainly that their plotting will not be tolerated, that it will be very much the worse for them if they persist in it, of course, Shanghai will have met for conspiracy. The time is ripe for drastic action.

CHINA'S MONUMENTS.

Once again we would return to the charge on the subject of the protection of China's ancient monuments. Although the number of those who can speak on this question with expert archaeological knowledge is small, the interest of the cause which Mr. Macmillan advances should appeal to every forward-looking citizen. That it may cynically be said, it is enough to damn it in the eyes of every Chinese. Yet something has been done, and it was as the direct outcome of agitation in these columns. Ten years ago that the late Viceroy Yuan Fang caused the boats at the Ming tombs. Nanking, to be enclosed in railings so as to guard them against vandalism. The result was not, perhaps, altogether artistically fortunate, but it was a step in the right direction. More important, it was the large number of influential Chinese whom, as a recent visitor of

BALKANS WEARY OF WAR.

DEFEAT OF THE ALBANIANS.

The Albanians have been defeated at Prizren and are being pursued in the direction of the frontier. M. Pasic, the Serbian Premier, has returned from abroad and has declared his conviction that there will be no further conflicts in the Balkans as they are all too weary to begin fresh complications. Reuter.

THE INTERVIEW IN VIENNA.

M. Pasic has expressed much satisfaction at the manner of his reception by Count Berchtold, the Austro-Hungarian Minister of Foreign Affairs. It is thought that the two statesmen's discussions will result in a more intimate economic understanding between Russia and Serbia as well as the building of a new railway. Vienna papers express much satisfaction at the result of the interview. "Quotidianer Lloyd."

TURKISH REBELLION.

GERMAN MILITARY INSTRUCTION.

The generalisation of the Turkish army has been a statement in connection with the signing of the peace with Bulgaria that the achievements of the Turkish army had surpassed all hopes. The army, he says, is full of personal ambition, loyal to the Fatherland and in the near future will require more than it has. Another German military mission will arrive at Constantinople in the near future to reorganise the Turkish army. A Prussian Major General will be at the head and will have ample powers. The Porte declines to entertain General Savoff's proposals for an alliance between Turkey and Bulgaria as long as there is any prospect of coming to an agreement with Greece. The great Powers have advised Greece to moderate her demands in response to the accommodating spirit shown by Turkey. "Kölnischer Lloyd."

KING FERDINAND ABROAD.

Berlin, Oct. 5.

THE NORTH-CHINA DAILY NEWS, TUESDAY, OCTOBER 7 1913.

ELECTION OF YUAN.

SUCCESSIVE BALLOTS.

RECOGNITION BY POWERS.

From Our Own Correspondent.

Peking, Oct. 6.

Yuan Shih-kai has been elected President by 507 votes.

The Vice-President General Li Xuan-hung received 179.

EARLIER IN THE DAY.

The result of the first ballot in the voting for the Presidency was as follows:—

Yuan Shih-kai ..... 471 votes.

Li Xuan-hung ..... 151 "

Sun Yat-sen ..... 12 "

Tung Shao-yi ..... 5 "

Kang Yu-wei ..... 11 "

Sun Wen ..... 3 "

Liang Chi-chiao ..... 4 "

Feng Kuo-chang ..... 4 "

Thai Yau-pai ..... 1 "

The following also received votes as follows:—

Wang Yan, 3; Luo Chikang, 1;

Wang Chai-jai, 16; Chu Jui-wei, 1;

Wang Ting-ching, 1; Wen Jen-wei, 1;

Chang Tzyun, 1; Huang Hsiang (the Premier), 4; Wang Cheng-ting, 1;

Wang Chao-ming, 1; Kung Shing Lo-ling, the Mongolian Senator, 3;

Ten Huan-huan, 2.

The result of the second ballot was:—

Yuan Shih-kai ..... 497 votes.

Li Xuan-hung ..... 109 "

Sun Yat-sen ..... 23 "

Wu Ting-fang ..... 23 "

The remainder of the votes were distributed among a few of the foregoing names.

A FULL ATTENDANCE.

Peking, Oct. 6.

At 8 o'clock this morning the election of the President began, the weather being favourable and the interest shown by the people was great.

The street traffic is in general not much more lively than on other days, but it is somewhat greater in the immediate vicinity of the Lower House, where the election is taking place.

THE PLAGUE AT WENCHOW.

AN APPALLING REPORT.

A DREADFUL DESTINY.

The Harbor Notification which appeared in our advertisement column, rather more than a week ago, pointing out that Wenchow was a plague-infected port, is more than substantiated by the reports that have come to hand in the last day or two from officers of vessels plying between Shanghai and Wenchow. The city of Wenchow is described as desolate, the inhabitants fleeing in every direction. The scourge is reported to be carrying off more than 100 people a day, and in the last ten days a rough computation puts the number of deaths at 1,000.

The local medical authorities are making splendid efforts to combat the disease, and no one is allowed to leave the port by steamer without first of all undergoing a thorough examination. The officers and crews of vessels discharging their cargo at Wenchow are strictly ordered not to land.

Since Thursday last, the infection is said to have increased, and the recent rains at that neighborhood have militated against the protection of preventative measures. For more than a decade Wenchow has been free of plague, the authorities being commended for the precautions adopted.

No explanation is forthcoming to explain the present outbreak, but it is feared on good authority that since the beginning of hostilities in Shanghai and Nanking, there has been a general influx of Chinese troops of all arms, as well as thousands of others from intervening ports. And an inquiry instituted by the British Consulate in the middle of September no fewer than half a dozen cases of plague were discovered, and before measures could be adopted to deal with them, the war had begun and the populace scattered.

M. POINCARÉ AND THE SIMPLE LIFE.

A DEMOCRATIC PRESIDENT.

From Our Own Correspondent.

Paris, Sept. 12.

President Poincaré is giving far

REBEL REFUGEES.

POSITION OF SHANGHAI.

BOMB TERRORISTS.

THE CHAPEL QUESTION AGAIN.

The tragedy of the recent bomb explosion in Hadell Road has been so far cleared up that the question of who the intended victim was is no longer in doubt. It is certainly exposing that person to further risk to publish his name. But with this discovery and in view of other information, the suggestion—as yet hardly strong—arises that the bomb has entered the arena of local as opposed to national politics.

To show the bearing of the Hadell Road tragedy upon this very serious question is, perhaps, better first, to mention an opinion expressed by a man generally well informed on these subjects.

This man, a Chinese, states that at the present moment a number of the prominent residents in Shanghai are in fear of their lives from bombs, which they believe are manufactured, or at least manipulated, in the Settlement. Their fear arises not from their actions in the field of national politics, but local affairs.

Towards the end of July, it will be remembered, residents of Chapel Hill addressed to the Municipal Council a letter relating to the protection of the northern suburb. It is suggested that by signing this letter, these men have brought upon themselves the wrath of the extremists in the district—and among these are the dealers in bombs, who have made the request of no great importance to the well being of the Settlement.

Now to come to what happened at Hadell Road.

The Bomb That Failed.

This tragedy as already stated has now been definitely connected with a well known local resident. The deceased meant to deposit the bomb to this man, enclosed in a package of Chinese books; in fact the books were tied up into a parcel and in the centre was a cavity for the insertion of the bomb.

ANOTHER BOMB FOUND.

Discovery in a Lodging House.

In view of the position detailed above, a discovery made by the police yesterday of another bomb in a lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of such a size that had it exploded it might have wrought the greatest havoc.

Acting upon information they had received, the police in the course of the morning visited the building No. 13 Wuhu Road, a type of lodging house, has peculiar importance. This bomb was of

试图劝阻士兵,告诉他们这些珍贵艺术品的价值,却彻底失败了。

马克密是一位亲华美国记者。他在1900年八国联军侵华之际来到了中国,为《哈泼周报》(Harper's Weekly)、《伦敦画报》(London Graphic)撰写时政新闻。他个人爱好艺术和文化,在中国生活期间,他寻访了许多古迹进行摄影和写生,也对中国文化产生了感情。他将中美之间的政治文化交流视为己任。为了进一步加强对亚洲的文化研究,他创设了亚洲文艺会(Asiatic Institute),并于1908年,特别在北京专门设立中国文艺会(China Monument Society),自任协会秘书。

马克密在清季民初的中国文化圈十分活跃,其影响力恐怕远超目前对他的研究所知。1908年,伯希和在甘肃敦煌莫高窟获得藏经洞文书后,曾于1909年5月从河内北上,经上海、南京抵达北京。伯希和在北京逗留期间,关于他在敦煌获得古代文书的消息为北京学术界所探知。1909年10月4日,经一美国人为中间介绍,北京学界曾在六国饭店宴请伯希和,由此引发中国“敦煌学”研究之发轫<sup>[6]453-454</sup>②。关于这一重大历史事件中,这位作为中间介绍人的美国人是谁?起初,学者王冀青推测为直隶总督兼北洋大臣端方的幕僚福开森(John Calvin Ferguson)<sup>[7]</sup>。2016年出版的《江瀚日记》补充了新的文献材料,揭示了这位美国人正是“马克密君”<sup>[8]705-706</sup>③。秦梓林的研究进一步考证,1909年在京举办的这场公宴,主要运作者是刑部主事董康以及大理院民科推丞兼学部谘议官王式通,背后的主导人是学部参事罗振玉,而参与公宴的16位中国学者,无一不是学部、京师大

学堂及大理院系统的官员<sup>④</sup>。1909年,当中国学术圈与伯希和第一次建立学术联系时,马克密已然身居引荐人之身份。公宴上中国学者做东,伯希和是受邀的主宾,马克密作为唯一的陪客,不仅联结了中外学术圈,也亲历见证了敦煌文书的外流现场。创立中国文艺会之后,马克密一方面广泛结交中国文化政要,在北京学界扩大知名度和影响力;另一方面也大量收集当时在华洋人的文化活动信息。这些跨文化的双边观察,使他更清晰地看到欧美收藏活动与中国古迹破坏之间的直接联系,这反映在他此后关于中国古迹保护的思考写作中,也体现在他推动中国文艺会工作的目标宗旨里。

“中国文艺会”是民国政府的翻译,用今天更准确的概念来说,应该是“中国古迹协会”。这个组织名称也显示了马克密关注倡议的核心对象,事实上正是19世纪欧洲保护运动所关注的“Monument”,以及诞生自这种不可移动文物而来的文化遗产体系。马克密曾在文章中提及,他创办这一组织的动力,源于香港爱国报业家谢纘泰在1904年的倡议<sup>⑤</sup>。从中国文艺会创办初始,马克密就希望通过游说呼吁、发表讲演和媒体力量来影响国际社会与中国上层力量。他的目标是利用中美两国之间的外交政治关系,提高中国人关于古迹保护的教育,最终使石窟寺这样正在不断被摧毁的Monument价值能够被普遍重视,在立法层面上推动政府采取保护行动<sup>⑥</sup>。

在关于龙门石窟的这篇报道中,他写道:

“在中国,愿意为了一天的生活口粮而毁神佛、砸雕塑的人到处都有,他们固然需要对摧毁这举世杰作负责。但是,真正犯下令人不齿的野蛮暴行的是那些

② 恽毓鼎1909年10月4日的日记记载:“王书衡、董授经侦知之,乃介一美利坚人以见伯希和,因得假观,并用摄影法付印”。

③ 江瀚1909年10月4日的日记记载:“晚赴六国饭店,公饯法国伯希和君,并美国马克密君。晤宝瑞宸、刘仲鲁、恽薇孙、刘幼云、王书衡、柯凤荪、徐梧生、金巩伯、姚恂恒、董授经、蒋伯斧、王静庵、王揖唐、吴印臣、耆寿民。盖伯希和游历新疆甘肃,得唐人写本甚多,叔祖已纪其原始。同人拟将所藏分别印谱,固有此举。伯君于中学颇深,不易得也”。《江瀚日记》出版后王冀青重新撰文,对此事件展开修正讨论,见:王冀青.伯希和1909年北京之行相关事件杂考[J].敦煌学辑刊,2017,35(4):167-176.

④ 具体参宴人员职位名单可见:秦梓林.1909年北京学界公宴伯希和事件补考:兼论王国维与早期敦煌学[J].浙江大学学报(人文社会科学版),2018,48(3):44-48.

⑤ 谢纘泰在1904年11月22日的《南华早报》上针对世界范围的考古探险潮呼吁:“应当成立一个国际性的组织,保护所有古老文明的文物和历史古迹,无论这些文物是在哪个国家出土发掘的,都不应该被其他国家破坏带走。”他还建议“出土的考古文物应该原地设专门展馆陈列展览”。这一20世纪初的呼吁在今天看来似有联合国世界遗产体系的雏形。

⑥ 关于China Monument Society,1913年《华北捷报》称这个“1908年在北京成立的组织,目标是阻止在华外国人对文物古迹的破坏,并促进提高中国本土的古迹保护意识”。见:Anonymous.China Monument[N].The North-China Herald,1913-06-07(692).

提供合作的外国人,是他们的默许与配合,让这场毁灭真正圆满实现。正在中国发生的汪达尔主义,理应该被看作是纯粹的邪恶,就像战争、奴隶制和鸦片一样。对这个古老文明的掠夺,比所有发生过的其他掠夺都更为可耻。因为世界文明向前进步了,文明本应该做得更好”<sup>[9]</sup>。

这篇社论中,首先可以看到,马克密对石窟寺的理解与远在巴黎和纽约豪宅的外国藏家不同,他把中国石窟寺视为“整体的、不可破坏的古迹遗产”而非“碎片的、孤立的佛教艺术品”;其次可以看到,马克密发声中对中国底层群众抱有同情和理解。在兵荒马乱的时代,为了口粮想要活下去是人类的一种本能。因而马克密将毁灭龙门石窟的真正责任,指向了从破坏中攫取利益的海外艺术品藏家。《字林西报》编辑部在同版刊登的回信中,也分析了突如其来的经济价值以及毫无意识的政府对石窟寺遗迹带来的灭顶之灾——“(石窟寺附近的)当地人开始慢慢意识到:这些石质雕刻具有货币价值(money value),这种价值,无疑是因为收藏家的出现而强加于他们的。这恰是新鲜而危险的源泉。希望中国人能够学习到,这些艺术珍宝如果能够完好保存不作交易买卖,也能制造巨大的经济价值(economic value)。中国政府应该参考意大利和希腊,在这2个国家里,古典世界的珍宝被小心地保护了起来,因为来参观它们的富有游客络绎不绝,使国家每年拥有了成千上万的收入”。

马克密自1913年1月起,就陆续在报刊撰文提倡关注中国古迹保存状况。《字林西报》及其周刊《北华捷报》是近代在中国创办的外文报业中,出版时间最长、影响最大的一份报纸。据数据统计,《字林西报》在远东的发行量是其他英文报纸的2倍。在该报的订阅者里,英国读者占39%,美国读者占25%,而中国本土的读者高达26%,其他国家占10%<sup>[10]</sup>。可见这份报纸的主要读者人群,是在华外籍人士与受过英文教育的中国文化精英。

1913年10月7日《字林西报》关于龙门石窟的专题新闻显然引起了广泛共鸣,有识之士纷纷就保护中国古迹的话题给报纸来信。10月9日,上海的哈

里·汤普森(Harry Thompson)写信给编辑部,回应马克密的龙门专题,他写道:“关于马克密先生与编辑部评论所讨论的中国古迹问题,任何一个(在中国生活的)人士,无须出门远游,只要稍微走两步,都能普遍意识到这些承载着中国伟大过往的史迹正在遭受多大的忽视,有些地方甚至正被蓄意破坏着。”汤普森列举了苏州虎丘塔、报恩寺塔的例子,用来说明中国各地都有珍贵的古迹,却因无人保护重视,现状越来越糟糕<sup>[11]</sup>。很快“保护中国古迹”就在时评界形成了一桩反响重大的社会舆论事件。后续的报道中,还揭露了更多关于龙门石窟的安全隐患。包括1位德国柏林博物院的麦勒博士称,有当地士兵向1位外国艺术商贩索要银两200万,承诺拿到钱就带头再举革命,然后在革命动乱的掩护下,把整个龙门石窟残存的所有雕刻石像都打包运出来,一起卖到西方市场<sup>[12]</sup>。

1913年11月,马克密感到时机成熟,于是以1封词肯意切的函件递交民国外交部总长,并在上呈的函件中附上了《字林西报》报道原文。外交部收到马克密的这份函件后,认为“所言颇为中肯”,遂将全文翻译后,在主管古物保存事项的内务部与教育部系统公文印发<sup>[13]</sup>。马克密保护古迹的主张深得时下爱国之士的认同,又以其社交灵活广泛,大概率在中国文化圈内部也得到了官员的推动支持。到了1914年,马克密函件与他后续的媒体采访,在民国政府内部受到了更高层的重视。这份马克密函件在政府公文体系内反复传播,1914年6月已经转呈国务院进行全体商讨,后直接递呈至大总统袁世凯审阅<sup>[14]</sup>。

在马克密的函件中,他提出2条建议:第一,从出口征税把控,取缔中国石刻造像的外流。他认为中国社会普遍没有意识到石窟寺雕刻的价值。建议中国官员前往世界博物馆和文物商店,考察外流的“中国美术古物”,就会明白这些偷售之物“在外洋所估之值”。第二,请中国政府遣派外交代表前往各国,禁止各国博物馆毁坏私运中国石刻造像。这样,中国的佛教造像才可以保存。虽然马克密担忧关注的对象是洛阳龙门石窟,但他以此为基础,倡议保护的

⑦ 外交部接到马克密函件后,最晚在1913年年末、1914年年初已经翻译完毕,转呈至主管古物古迹的教育部门和内务部门。

是中国全境的石质不可移动文物,因为他知道中国境内各个地区有着丰富的石窟寺和古迹,“四川之穴庙,及无数伟像之在陕西、山西、四川、云南、福建等省者,均有历史上及美术上之大价值”。他警告说:中国目前毁坏古物已经成风,如若不从国家层面阻止,“中国将来必唾弃向来富有之古物学及美术而漫不顾惜”<sup>[15]</sup>。

亚洲文艺会成立后,一时政治影响力颇大,由多国使馆代表担任协会董事,包括英国、俄国、法国、美国、意大利和日本的外交人员,还吸收了300多位海外汉学家成为其会员。到了1914年,马克密甚至能进一步致函当时的美国国务卿布里安(Lillian Jennings Bryan),倡导美国政府从外交手段上约束本国人对中国艺术品搜寻而造成的古迹破坏<sup>[16]</sup>。1914年4月在马克密接受的采访中,他称亚洲文艺会关于“保护中国古迹”的倡议,“已经在美国900多份报纸印发宣传,英国、法国、德国相关媒体都刊登了相应专题,并对这一提议表达了深切的同情与支持”<sup>[17]</sup>。

#### 4 龙门石窟事件的后续影响与意义

这一系列的国际外交斡旋引起了显著效果,新成立的民国政府十分重视龙门石窟的盗凿事件。内务部在接到外交部翻译的马克密函件后,于1914年2月28日,立刻下发训令河南民政长商明河南都督。训令中称,“为咨行事案准外交部函送美国马克密来函,并附《字林西报》论说等件到部。据此察核,该报所论均于中国保存古物,意在禁止毁弃,立意甚善……兹阅该报所载谓龙门穴中旧存雕像有驻扎该处兵丁任意毁坏等语……若如该报所言,一任兵丁毁坏,官吏既漫不经心,士民复无从过问,长此不理,势必日损月削,毁弃无存,坐令国粹消亡,外邦腾笑,微特贤士大夫之责,抑亦中华民国之羞也”,于是要求河南严饬驻军,并由民政长派遣专员和洛阳县(今

洛阳市)地方官一起开展清点龙门石窟造像登录<sup>⑧</sup>。这次事件的最终回复处理在1916年10月,由河南省省长田文烈把龙门事件的办理情况上呈至内务部,订立了《保守龙门山石佛规条》,并查明咨复了1份《龙门山等处造象数目表》<sup>[18]</sup>。

《保守龙门山石佛规条》列明内容为:①严禁外人及士兵毁坏或盗窃;②要求当地负责的和尚和地保加意保护、随时稽查,若有毁坏或盗窃者,准予报告或亲自扭送到案;③张贴严禁毁坏或窃盗的布告;④知事随时密派侦探前往稽查;⑤有拿获毁坏或盗窃者,无论何色人等,赏银20两;⑥遇各界人等前往石窟游览,准许和尚每人收取游资20文,以资保护津贴。

1913—1914年的龙门石窟事件,涉及国际外交,马克密的新闻报道和上书函件由外交部翻译后,先通报内务部、教育部系统,后直达国务院与大总统,不仅引起了国内政要精英的注意,而且作为附件层层下发给各级部门,是近代中国从政府层面开启石窟寺保护的第一大案件。这次事件直接促使了1914年6月14日《大总统发布限制古物出口令》的颁布,是“中华民国”成立后,第一条关于文物保护的官方法令。尽管龙门事件从1913年引发新闻舆论,到1914年内务部下发训令,其间由于受到了袁世凯复辟等政治波动,历经3年直至1916年才落实监督,但此次事件以作为整体的“石窟寺”为关注核心,在推动传统金石学向现代文物观上转变产生了重大意义。

首先,从时代背景来看,自1905年(光绪三十一年)晚清五大臣出洋考察后,清政府就启动了“保存古迹”的中央官制改革。1909年(宣统元年),民政部《保存古迹推广办法》条例的颁布,标志着中国近代化保护古物古迹的意识萌芽,许多学者对这个时期文物保护理念的变化做了详尽梳理<sup>[19-20]</sup>。清末民政部已经注意到西方人员来华大肆掠夺文物的情形,在条例中列明要保护“碑碣石幢造像”“古庙名人画壁并

⑧ 1914年,时任内务总长为营造学社的创立者朱启钤。朱启钤此时兼任京都市政督办,主要任务为主持规划改建北京城,在接到外交部转发的马克密函件后,他所主持的内务部对河南龙门石窟事件做出快速反应,体现了他在不可移动文物保护方面的远见。见:内务部文牍,咨河南都督准外交部函称《字林西报》论说关于中国保存古物禁止毁弃等语[M]//内务部总务厅统计科.内务公报.北京:国家图书馆出版社,2010.

雕刻塑像”。然而,刘文华通过档案研究分析指出:在清末《保存古迹推广办法》推进与实施的具体过程中,地方措施依旧集中于书籍、碑刻、风景名胜、名祠古墓等具有传统金石儒学特点的保护对象。清廷中央的民政部,也只是沿袭此前工部的工作,做了保护陵寝、修筑城垣等琐事,因此“直到清朝灭亡,民政部有关古迹保护的具体作为还是沿袭多、建设少、进展慢、成效比较有限”<sup>[21]</sup>。石刻佛像与菩萨像,在中国传统中并不被看作艺术审美对象<sup>⑨</sup>。在民国成立之初,石窟也并没有成为古迹保护的关注重点。而1913年马克密书写的报道,以龙门石窟为具体对象,清楚分析了以下4点:①石质佛教造像在国际层面作为中国雕塑,具有极高艺术价值;②西方人因艺术收藏活动,赋予了造像经济货币价值;③利益链条下古董商参与的石窟寺盗凿和市场交易猖獗;④国人却将其视作单纯宗教寺庙空间,任其破坏之漠视。马克密函件在民国政府内部广为传播,被列为《限制古物出口令》的附件,恰因其点明了佛教造像的艺术价值在国内外存在认知落差,这一新知惊醒了衮衮诸公,也督促民国政府正视石窟寺盗凿现象的本质,明确立法禁止佛头出口的迫切。

其次,在系列报道的倡议下,Monument作为一个反复强调的概念,围绕石窟寺为具体对象在国际层面展开宣传,突出了被敲击夺走的佛教造像是不可移动的山体洞穴的一部分,对具有纪念碑性质的石质古迹砸锤,毫无疑问是世界公认的破坏、是全人类文明的倒退。为了突出Monument这一概念,马克密及其后续报道函件,刻意绕开了皇家器物、书画瓷器等外流(可移动)古董的贸易讨论,只围绕“石窟寺破坏”这个单一议题展开了讨论和强烈谴责<sup>⑩</sup>。显然在这一涉及“破坏”的严肃问题上,更容易在虎视眈眈、角力

掠夺中国文化资源的时局下,让各个西方国家达成国际层面的道德共识。

再次,来华探险潮后,许多石窟寺的破坏都有当地僧人参与在内。在丰厚金钱利诱下,原本不能买卖之物,一夜之间有了交换价值。因为古老的石窟寺一度被视为清季民初一些寺院的资产,这就引发一些僧人出于“重妆”“重建”等目的,出卖部分风霜残旧的古代佛教造像,换取资金整修新寺,以求积累功德。许多学者在现代文物保护伦理已成为公众常识的基础上,往往痛心批评如王圆箴之流的僧众和老百姓的“愚昧不知”所造成的大量国宝的外流。然而,放在具体的历史语境下看,这恰恰是封建思想和动荡时局下,基于宗教逻辑的一种价值选择。龙门石窟事件的发酵,对于石窟寺的所有权问题做了全新的定性——第一次以龙门石窟寺为代表,将石窟视作一个整体的古迹对象,强调了国家层面的公共价值,并突出了石窟寺作为杰出的艺术珍品宝库的身份。《限制古物出口令》称“中国文化最古,艺术最精,凡国家之所留贻,社会之所珍护,非但供考古之研究,实关于国粹之保存”,不仅明确了“国粹”的地位,还阐明了石窟寺的一系列突出价值意义:文化、艺术、可供考古研究,而且在民国政府除旧布新的一系列政策推动下,强调中国文物古迹为公共所有、全民所有。文物的主权意识开始逐步萌芽。

最后,可以说在一种西方审美目光的塑造和掠夺下,古代佛教造像被罢黜了神圣偶像的身份,重新以“雕塑”的概念被挪入了世界艺术品的殿堂。这种目光由率先进入现代化的西方国家发起,它们重新定义了像和人之间的关系,也永远改变了许多中国石窟寺造像的命运。天龙山石窟、响堂山石窟、龙门石窟,都受到这种“局部艺术品”观念的冲击。大规模的盗

⑨ 在清末《保护古迹推广办法》里,民政部官员写:“石质古物,近年以来,每为寺僧及不肖匪徒所盗卖,因之洋商络绎,将我碑版诸物归本国者,时有所闻”。反映了时下古物保护观虽然在走向现代化,但依然基于中国金石收藏的知识体系,误以为外国人从石窟寺庙中掠走的是碑版石刻。

⑩ 《论中国古碑之被盗》一文中,特意写明“此文仅论碑碣、与寻常买卖古书古磁器古画无涉”,外交部译《字林西报》编辑部信刊中也强调“美术品之买卖,本无可反对”,“所有发生强有力之反对者,则大号古器,往往因不能出运,便斲碎之,斲之不已,其后必至消灭,即不消灭,所存之件亦必体残容毁,至其原有之美丽及性质,固丧失矣”。除了这些公开发表的时论之外,马克密本人的行为并非像其文字所主张的那样道德完满,对其私人信件研究发现,他本人自1903年起,也参与中国书画向美国市场外流的买卖,可见:Kin-Yee Ian Shin.Making “Chinese Art”:knowledge and authority in the transpacific progressive era[D].New York City:Columbia University,2016.

凿破坏,加速了石窟寺宗教关系的衰落和断裂,也让民国政府在被动中加强了整体保护石窟寺古迹的意识。1914年《大总统限制古物出口令》的颁布,终止了清季民初关于文物保护各个行政部门间的推诿扯皮和职权斗争,推动了外交部、内务部、税务处的联合合作<sup>①</sup>,为未来的文物保护法规制定奠定了基础,这在一定程度上,遏制了自清末以来全国石窟寺大规模肆无忌惮的破坏。然而对于今天的学者来说,龙门事件或许对我们重新思考石窟寺的艺术价值到底为何有着长足深远的启示。

**致谢:**本文略有修改,曾在2021年东华大学“丝绸之路艺术史·长三角青年论坛”报道过。感谢荣新江、韩琦、毛秋瑾等诸位师长对本文的建议与帮助,学者范丽雅关于山中商会的最新研究对本文也有所启发。

#### 参考文献

- [1] HOLMES C J. Archaic Chinese bronzes[J]. Burlington Magazine for Connoisseurs, 1905, 7(25): 18-31.
- [2] ABE S K. From Stone to sculpture: the alchemy of the modern[M]// SWERGOLD L, HSU E H. Treasures Rediscovered: Chinese Stone Sculpture from the Sackler Collections. New York City: Columbia University, 2008: 7-16.
- [3] LOO C T. An Exhibition of Chinese stone sculptures[M]. New York: The William Bradford Press, 1940.
- [4] ABE S K. Collecting Chinese sculpture: Paris, New York, Boston[M]// CHONG A, MURAI N. Journeys East: Isabella Stewart Gardner and Asia. Boston: Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum, 2009: 432-442.
- [5] 罗振玉. 五十日梦痕录[EB/OL]. (2006-10-15)[2021-10-11]. <https://www.bookinlife.net/book-249908-viewpic.html#page=2>.
- [6] 恽毓鼎. 恽毓鼎澄斋日记(第2册)[M]. 杭州: 浙江古籍出版社, 2004.
- [7] 王冀青. 清宣统元年(1909年)北京学界公宴伯希和事件再探讨[J]. 敦煌学辑刊, 2014, 32(2): 130-142.
- [8] 江瀚. 江瀚日记[M]. 北京: 国家图书馆出版社, 2016.
- [9] MCCORMICK F. Monuments of China: desecrating the caves of Longmen[N]. The North-China Daily News, 1913-10-07(7).
- [10] 李珊. 《北华捷报》上的中国投书人: 国民革命时期民族主义的对外表达[J]. 近代史研究, 2018, 40(4): 29-31.
- [11] THOMPSON H A. China's Monuments[N]. The North-China Daily News, 1913-10-09(7).
- [12] “中华民国”史事纪要编辑委员会. 论中国古碑之被盗[M]//“中华民国”史事纪要编辑委员会. “中华民国”史事纪要(初稿)“中华民国”三年(1914年)五至六月份. 台北: “中华民国”史料研究中心, 1982: 945-946.
- [13] 佚名. 马克密君所拟保存中国古物办法(外交部译发)[J]. 江苏教育行政月报, 1914, 1(11): 140-146.
- [14] 佚名. 关于中国古物被盗之谈片及纪事[J]. 东方杂志, 1913, 10(12): 34-36.
- [15] “中华民国”史事纪要编辑委员会. 外交部译发《马克密君保存中国古物办法之函件》[M]//“中华民国”史事纪要编辑委员会. “中华民国”史事纪要(初稿)“中华民国”三年(1914年)五至六月份. 台北: “中华民国”史料研究中心, 1982: 946-947.
- [16] 李建. 我国近代文物保护法制化进程研究[D]. 济南: 山东大学, 2015.
- [17] Anonymous. Interview with Mr Frederick McCormick on China's Monument[N]. The North-China Daily News, 1914-04-27(8).
- [18] 中国第二历史档案馆. 保守龙门山石佛规条[M]//中国第二历史档案馆. “中华民国”史档案资料记编(第三辑: 文化). 南京: 江苏古籍出版社, 1991: 192-196.
- [19] 李晓东. 民国文物法规评述[M]. 北京: 文物出版社, 2013.
- [20] 刘守柔. 清末民国文化遗产保护的兴起与演进研究[D]. 上海: 复旦大学, 2014.
- [21] 刘文华. 清末民政部与近代文物保护事业: 兼及主事尚秉和之事迹[J]. 中国国家博物馆馆刊, 2020, 42(3): 156-158.

<sup>①</sup> 大量文物外流涉及出口关税问题,因此早在1912年,税务处就致函内务部要求将保存古物章程检送至税务处。内务部称正在拟定,长久没有结果。同样1912年,外交部建议教育部提倡设立国家博物院,并协同税务处制定章程,限止贩运。各部门间关于文物古迹的函件往来,既有责任推诿,又有职权相争。关于这个议题的研究十分丰富,可见:江琳.民国时期文物保护事业的体制之争[J].江苏师范大学学报(哲学社会科学版),2014,40(3):61-66.